

**European Association
of Establishments for Veterinary Education**

**Association Européenne
des Établissements d'Enseignement Vétérinaire**



REVISITATION REPORT

To Ecole nationale vétérinaire d'Alfort (EnvA), Paris, France

On June 6, 2017 to June 8, 2017

By the Revisitation Team:

Chair: Petr Horin, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine
University of Veterinary and Pharmaceutical Sciences, BRNO, Czech Republic

Coordinator: Philip Duffus, University of Bristol, United Kingdom

Contents of the Revisitation Report

Introduction

- 1. Correction of the Major Deficiencies**
- 2. Correction of the Minor Deficiencies**
- 3. ESEVT Indicators**
- 4. Executive Summary**

Introduction

The Ecole Nationale Vétérinaire d'Alfort (EnvA) was visited (full visitation) on the 13-17 of April, 2015 by the ESEVT in accordance with the "Budapest" SOP - May 2012, Stage 1. During the visitation, the ESEVT Visitation Team identified several deficiencies. Based on these observations, the Committee of ECOVE concluded on November 19th, 2015, that one of these deficiencies was considered to be a Major Deficiency, leading to a Stage 1 Conditional Approval status for the EnvA. The major deficiency identified was: "Inadequate drugs' storage and biosecurity procedures in farm animal and equine facilities". Furthermore, eight minor deficiencies were recognized and listed by ECOVE.

1. Correction of the Major Deficiencies

1.1. Major Deficiency 1: *"Inadequate drugs' storage and biosecurity procedures in farm animal and equine facilities"*

1.1.1. Findings

Supervision of all clinic pharmacies and implementation of regular control measures

Based on audits of the central pharmacy and on other auxiliary pharmacies located both in the central campus in Alfort and in extramural facilities in Champignelles, changes in the overall management of all pharmacies were implemented. These audits led to an update of the medication circuit allowing the traceability of all drugs. Auxiliary pharmacies (one per clinic) were created, for which individual responsibilities were assigned and one individual in charge was appointed. The changes made in the equine and farm animal pharmacies include electronic access to all units, electronic recording system, an update of procedures adapted to new French legislation as well as developing specific management of controlled drugs. Individual and group authorizations to access and utilise drugs were defined.

Procedures for the use of drugs have been updated and displayed in each facility. Drug expiration dates are regularly monitored and outdated drugs are eliminated. Opening dates for each multi-dose vial/bottle must be now written on the associated packaging. In addition, inventory of all drugs is now performed on a regular basis.

Biosecurity procedures

New biosecurity procedures have been generated. In addition to existing procedures, related mostly to research and clinical laboratories, they now cover all important activities of EnvA. A comprehensive Biosecurity Manual was produced in collaboration with all relevant units and it is accessible on the intranet. Its format allows continuous updates based on feedback from the units.

Based on preliminary examples, students were taught about the principles of biosecurity. Following their increased knowledge of the importance of biosecurity, students have successfully involved themselves in the preparation of information materials for pet owners.

Two new committees have been created: CoBios (Committee for Biosecurity) and CLIN (Local committee for control of nosocomial infections) to address biosecurity issues at the Establishment level. CLIN was created in 2010 and CoBios created in January 2017. CLIN was restricted to the clinics whilst CoBios now tackles all the biosecurity problems in an integrated and comprehensive manner. These committees have been established with a membership drawn from all the major units in EnvA.

Upgrade of facilities in the Equine and Farm Animal Clinics

As it is somewhat difficult to adapt the old historical facilities to the current norms, the EnvA decided, in agreement with the Normandy Region, to move all medical and surgery activities related to the equine clinics to the Normandy site. Teaching in this newly built extension, dedicated to equine medicine and surgery, should start at the end of 2019.

For the time being, procedures aiming to maximize biosecurity and biosafety in the Equine Clinic have been elaborated and implemented, especially procedures minimizing risks of contagious disease, including procedures for cleaning and disinfecting work surfaces. These procedures are written and displayed on barriers delineating controlled zones as well as on doors.

A project to build new facilities for the Farm Animal Clinics **within** the Alfort campus has been approved and is due to be funded in the near future.

For facilities, which will not be renovated, adaptations have been made to comply with the new circulation plans and biosecurity procedures, including the extramural facility in Champignelles. Beside the changes discussed above involving the newly implemented system of managing pharmacies, the necropsy room has been renovated, with new external areas for storing biological materials. In addition, new equipment for the necropsy room has been installed and the necropsy table renovated. The biosecurity manual was updated and all new procedures are displayed. The flow of materials (carcasses) and of people (including students) was adapted to comply with biosecurity standards.

1.1.2. Comments

EnvA has addressed all critical issues related to drug handling and storage. The newly implemented system has reflected changes in the French legislation, and currently all

procedures comply with the new rules. A more effective control of auxiliary pharmacies has also been introduced. Access to controlled drugs has been limited to selected persons and appropriate records kept. The team were able to verify that at all levels, locks and electronic control mechanisms were functional and that appropriate records are kept.

In the Equine clinic, some potentially dangerous drugs are accessible in unlocked boxes within locked rooms, albeit with limited access. The clinicians argued that in case of an emergency, quick access to critical drugs is necessary. Taking into consideration that only “instructed” persons (including final year students) have access to this locked area, this was seen as acceptable. So far, no problems related to this arrangement were recorded.

It was clear during the initial visitation in 2015 that biosecurity procedures were critically limited by the physical condition of old buildings. However, whilst the extensive renovations and/or constructions of new buildings have certainly contributed to improvements in biosecurity procedures, further renovation and the planned new buildings will contribute to further improvements in this area. As for the present situation, the team could see that the biosecurity procedures have improved, and biosecurity risks for students and staff diminished.

The new Biosecurity Manual is a useful tool, available to all units, and is both flexible and adaptable to current needs. The team appreciated the work done on this important document.

Involvement of students not only in terms of their direct teaching, but also in terms of the student led propagation of biosecurity principles among owners and the student community itself was a very good idea, as well as feedback on the knowledge of biosecurity principles obtained from students by students.

However, a number of minor omissions from the rules were still observed during the visitation, such as unwashed boots in a clean area, missing dates on opened vials, non-functional cleaning devices, and procedures depending on a single and specific person. Such omissions are minor and easily rectified.

1.1.3. Suggestions

Further effort to improve the technical condition of old buildings is recommended.

A regular evaluation and control of all implemented procedures is recommended to avoid even minor misconduct in this area.

1.1.4. Decision

The Major Deficiency has been fully corrected.

2. Correction of the Minor Deficiencies

2.1. Minor Deficiency 1: ***“Insufficient efficiency and communication skills of most of administrative departments (although recently improved)”***

2.1.1. Findings

The management team was restructured in 2015 and 2016. The accounting manager, the head of the Financial Affairs office, the head of the Human Resources office, and the General Secretary were newly recruited during the last two years.

Representatives of the administrative staff are now involved in various councils and committees of EnvA (Governing board, Teaching and Student Life council, Academic council, departmental councils). The aim is to allow their better understanding of teaching and research activities and to promote their interactions with Establishment's units.

2.1.2. Comments

Feedback obtained by the team from all groups of personnel addressed was clearly positive. Direct interactions with departments concerning personal issues and financial affairs were appreciated.

This problem, although classified as "minor deficiency", has been addressed properly and brought a clear benefit to the Establishment. The changes made led not only to elimination of negative interactions between administration and the rest of the school, but the new administration proved to be very helpful at all levels, especially in personal affairs (for example, recruitment of new staff at the departmental level).

2.1.3. Suggestions

None

2.2. Minor Deficiency 2: *"Lack of freedom to use the incomes from services and continuing education"*

2.2.1. Findings

Continuing education and clinical income currently represent an important resource for the Establishment. Such income represents approximately 45% of the total budget of the School, and the services responsible for generating this income can benefit from a large part of these incomes.

Each teaching department or office (15 centers of responsibilities - CRs) proposes a draft budget for the upcoming year in September of the current year. This draft budget is negotiated during a managerial dialog with the CRs. The budget implementation is adjusted twice a year to balance incomes and expenditures.

2.2.2. Comments

It seems that the problem identified during the first visitation in 2015 was due to a critical financial situation in French schools in this period, combined with little flexibility of related legislation.

Currently, the situation has improved, which has allowed the Establishment to better allocate its finances. The team appreciated that budgeting is subject to a dialog allowing a reasonable mutual agreement on the allocation of money earned by different organizational units.

2.2.3. Suggestions

None

2.3. Minor Deficiency 3: *“Inadequate clinical training in the pig and poultry sector”*

2.3.1. Findings

A swine necropsy session has been organized in Champignelles to obtain more access to increased hands-on teaching. The number of necropsied pigs increased from 22 in 2014 up to 124 in 2016-2017. Workshops are being developed in the Clinical Skill Lab: restraint of pigs using a lasso; nasal swabbing of piglets and blood sampling on piglets' ear veins.

A new associate professor will be recruited for developing the area of pig and poultry diseases.

2.3.2. Comments

EnvA has addressed this problem. It is clear that it is a work in progress.

2.3.3. Suggestions

Taking into consideration the potential risk for future accreditations, it is recommended to pay attention to this area until the changes in progress are fully implemented.

2.4. Minor Deficiency 4: *“Lack of standards and control measures of most EMS”*

2.4.1. Findings

Mandatory EMS is organized for students in the early years utilizing units, such as dairy farms, and for the 4th and 5th-year in rural practices. Every student must complete a precise and extensive case load file. In addition, the filling of an evaluation sheet by the supervisor is mandatory. Once this evaluation sheet is sent to the teacher in charge, the EMS is validated based on the reports written by the student as well as the supervisor.

In a recent development, fifth-year students can now choose a new track named “tutorat” (tutorship) characterized by a long term EMS (18 weeks or more) and supported at the national level by the Ministry of Agriculture. In this track, students can choose between selected practices that have been previously approved by a national selection committee. The teacher in charge of tutorship must visit (at least once) each practice during the EMS. A comprehensive list of objectives and skills that the student needs to fulfil is mandatory and signed by the practitioners. Cross evaluation between the student and the practitioner is also mandatory.

2.4.2. Comments

The changes adopted have improved the standard of EMS in EnvA. More emphasis has been put on academic supervision and on standardization of this form of teaching. The tutorship track is supported by the Ministry of Agriculture and Food as a result of shortage of veterinarians working in the large animal practice.

2.4.3. Suggestions

Further improvements based on the Ministry's support could be implemented in the context of QA. Especially, formal activities related to the selection and accreditation of teaching practices would be beneficial for the quality, transparency and standardization of the system.

2.5. Minor Deficiency 5: *"Lack of 24H emergency services in farm animals"*

2.5.1. Findings

There is no active emergency service for farm animals, but students are exposed to these emergencies as part of the EMS they carry out in rural practices: Since the 2016/2017 academic year, a special report on the emergency cases seen during the practicals has been mandatory for the students.

Clinical cases of small ruminants, rabbits or poultry are received through the Emergency Service of the Small Animal Clinic. In addition, a limited number of clinical cases are received directly on some occasions by the Farm Animal Clinic on evenings or weekends.

2.5.2. Comments

This is an issue related to the location of EnvA within the Paris area with limited numbers of urgent farm animal clinical cases and especially with heavy traffic causing difficult access to the Establishment.

In general, alternative solutions are sought by many Establishments to overcome such problems. The ultimate goal should be to make sure that day one graduates have been exposed to these situations and have basic skills in emergency medicine.

The approach adopted by EnvA aims to combine experience from EMS and from occasional cases seen in the clinics in Alfort. The team felt that this was a useful approach provided that a proper recording system and a control of quality of such teaching are established.

2.5.3. Suggestions

It is recommended to further standardize the recording system and the control of quality of this form of teaching, including evaluation of competencies in this area.

2.6. Minor Deficiency 1: *"Inadequate coverage in Food Safety and VPH, especially in the pig, poultry and fish sector"*

2.6.1. Findings

Practical teachings of meat inspection (including one week of EMS) has been moved to the 3rd year, when students have acquired necessary knowledge and competencies. This EMS is integrated for its evaluation in a competency unit that has been specifically created and deals exclusively with food hygiene.

Arrangements with local food processing units have been made to organize visits to these centres around the Champignelles Centre in the 4th year. An additional half-day has been added for tutored work in the “food hygiene” rotation for the 4th year. The development of teaching in food microbiology is planned at the national level.

The French situation is unique in that health veterinarians are officials trained one year at the National School of Veterinary Services in Lyon.

2.6.2. Comments

Here again, it is important for EnvA to address this issue in the view of future EAEVE accreditations. However, facts provided by the RSER relate to the Minor Deficiency # 7 rather than to this # 6. During the visitation, the team has got information that this task is still pending. It is rather difficult to find around Paris slaughterhouses for pigs and poultry and foodstuff producers giving enough opportunities to teach students food hygiene and VPH in pigs, poultry and fish. EnvA is aware of this problem.

2.6.3. Suggestions

To further investigate how to extend students’ specific knowledge in food hygiene and VPH for pigs, poultry and fish in a mid-term perspective to ensure compliance with EAEVE standards defined by the new SOPs. Perhaps a motivated expert in the field could be put in charge of this task.

2.7. Minor Deficiency 7 “*Lack of practical training in food technology and food microbiology*”

2.7.1 Factual information

Visits to food industries, and slaughterhouses were added to the overall teaching plans. Teaching of food hygiene was moved from the 2nd year to the 3rd year and practicals on recognizing anatomical parts with abnormalities or lesions related to non-infectious diseases were introduced. A half-day dedicated to food microbiology supervised seminars has been added in the 4th year, and another half-day is devoted to a session of synthesis of tutored work. In addition, a workshop is under development, based within the clinical skills laboratory.

2.7.2. Comments

Along with information provided in the previous section on Minor Deficiency # 6, these facts show that improvements made so far are a definite step in the right direction.

2.7.3. Suggestions

In the context of the national activities in this area, EnvA is encouraged to collaborate with other French veterinary schools and with the national authorities to design a new concept to deliver teaching of food hygiene and VPH, which would comply with the new EAEVE standards.

2.8. Minor Deficiency 8: *“Lack of e-books and lack of VPN for all students (to access the intranet from outside of the Establishment)”*

2.8.1. Findings

Using data storage in Microsoft Office365 allows both students and staff to share files via sharepoints accessible from any location.

With Dawsonera, 54 e-books are currently available for students. They are accessible on the library web page (<http://bibliotheque.vet-alfort.fr/>) through Shibboleth. Students and staff can connect to it from outside the School. All teachers are now requested to buy electronic versions of books instead of hard copies in order to make them accessible to the whole community, including students.

The access to the journals from outside of the Alfort campus is now available via proxy-PHP.

2.8.2. Comments

This issue has been addressed properly and the problem has been fully resolved thanks to a significant contribution and professionalism of the librarian.

2.8.3. Suggestions

None

Overall comments on Minor Deficiencies

Improvements in the areas recognized by the first visitation team as minor deficiencies are documented. In many aspects, EnvA has progressed to avoid potential problems related to EAEVE accreditation based on the new SOPs. In some areas, it is a long-term task and further activities are needed. EnvA will be confronted with all these issues when preparing its first interim report based on the new (Uppsala) SOPs.

3. ESEVT Indicators

Not applicable.

4. Executive Summary

Brief history of the Establishment and its previous EAEVE Visitations

The Ecole nationale vétérinaire d’Alfort (EnvA) was created in 1766. It has been visited by EAEVE in 2001 and 2015. The ECOVE decision on the Stage 1 visitation in 2015 was Conditional Approval. During this latter visitation, the ESEVT Visitation Team identified several deficiencies. Based on these observations, the Committee of ECOVE concluded on November 19th, 2015, that one of these deficiencies was considered to be a Major Deficiency,

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 28 NOVEMBER 2017

leading to the Stage 1 Conditional Approval status for the EnvA. The major deficiency identified was: “Inadequate drugs’ storage and biosecurity procedures in farm animal and equine facilities”.

Furthermore, eight minor deficiencies were recognized and listed by ECOVE.

The revisitation to assess the progress in correcting the major and minor deficiencies was undertaken on June 6th to 8th 2017. This Stage 1 re-visitation was performed concurrently with a Stage 2 QA visitation, which is the subject of a separate report.

Brief comment on the revisitation SER (R-SER)

The R-SER was a mixture of text and visual evidence. Due to time constraints and the distance to extramural facilities in Champignelles it was decided before the visitation to rely on written and visual evidence, together with specific interviews with staff. The Team found the R-SER comprehensive with additional evidence clarified on site.

Brief comment on the revisitation

The overall atmosphere during the visitation was very friendly and constructive, and the whole visit was conducted in an open and professional way. Due to the unique type of the visitation in the transition period the schedule for the assessment of the major and minor deficiencies was achieved by a series of visits to the relevant teaching facilities. The short presentations by the academic staff in the beginning of the meetings were informative with the relevant persons participating in them.

Commendations (areas worth of praise identified by the Team)

EnvA has addressed all critical issues related to drug handling and storage; the newly implemented system has reflected changes in the French legislation, and currently all procedures comply with the new rules. In addition, an effective control system utilising auxiliary pharmacies has been introduced with access to controlled drugs been limited to selected persons.

Recommendations

The Major Deficiency has been fully corrected.

Decision of ECOVE

The Committee concluded that the Major Deficiency, identified in 2015, had been rectified.

The 'École Nationale Vétérinaire d'Alfort' is therefore classified as holding the status of:
APPROVAL.